

**From:** Ibarluzea Maurolagoitia, Jesús  
**Sent:** Tue, 2 Aug 2022 16:24:45 +0000  
**To:** Holder, Gregory (CDC/DDNID/NCCDPHP/DOH)  
**Subject:** RE: Request to discuss your fluoride study

Dear Holder.

I am afraid that this question has gone out of my hands.  
I will not attend any video call in which my Director of Public Health is present.  
The research that we carry out, we publish or we spread is only under our own responsibility, not under any kind of legitimation or intromission. We get the financial Support by means of the proposal that we send to different calls of a wide diversity of institutions.

I accepted this invitation as a researcher and in the name of our research group. The director was informed just in term of politeness.  
So, I am sorry, deeply sorry, but I am not going to take part in any call or presentation.

I will appreciate considering this e-mail as something absolutely confidential.  
May be in another moment.

The best  
Jesús Ibarluzea

***Please delete this message.***

---

**De:** Larizgoitia Jauregui, Iciar <i-larizgoitia@euskadi.eus>  
**Enviado el:** martes, 2 de agosto de 2022 18:06  
**Para:** LHN5@cdc.gov  
**CC:** Ibarluzea Maurolagoitia, Jesús <j-ibarluzea@euskadi.eus>  
**Asunto:** RE: Request to discuss your fluoride study

Dear Mr Holder,

Allow me please to introduce myself. My colleague Jesús Ibarluzea shared with me your kind invitation below. I am the Director of Public Health at the Health Department of the Basque Government (the institution that hosts Jesús Ibarluzea research unit). At this very moment, we are pondering precisely the yet existing policy in the Basque Region of water fluoridation, while reviewing the new evidence. As he shared with me this morning the CDC invitation below, I was considering the session might be also helpful to us, precisely now, as usually is sharing new knowledge and best practices. If it would be acceptable, I very much appreciate listening to the conversation, although I will also understand if this is not the case.

I thank you in advance, and add my appreciation for the CDC's interest in the research conducted by Jesús Ibarluzea and his team.

Sincerely,

Dr Itziar Larizgoitia  
Directora de Salud Pública y Adicciones/ Director of Public Health  
Departamento de Salud / Osasun Saila / Department of Health  
Eusko Jauriaritza / Gobierno Vasco / Basque Government

Tel: (b)(6)

---

**De:** Ibarluzea Maurologoitia, Jesús  
**Enviado el:** martes, 2 de agosto de 2022 8:44  
**Para:** Holder, Gregory (CDC/DDNID/NCCDPHP/DOH) <[LHN5@cdc.gov](mailto:LHN5@cdc.gov)>  
**CC:** Gallastegi Bilbao, Mara <[m-gallastegibilbao@euskadi.eus](mailto:m-gallastegibilbao@euskadi.eus)>  
**Asunto:** RE: Request to discuss your fluoride study

Dear Gregory.

(b)(6) and at the end of it (Organizing Committee) the Spanish-Portuguese Epidemiology Congress is going to be held here in San Sebastian. We will be hard at work until the International Environmental Congress (ISEE-Athens) finish. So we could reschedule a presentation for the last days of September or early November. In both Congresses we will present the results of Fluoride (urine) and TDHD at 1, 7 and 11 years in the same cohort (INMA-Gipuzkoa). I do not know if you would be interested in including this data also in the presentation.

Looking forward to hearing from you.

*Jesús Ibarluzea*

*MSc Biology, MSc Psychology, MSc Environmental Health, PhD (Epidemiology and Public Health).*

*Health Department of the Basque Country.*

*BIODONOSTIA Health Research Institute*

*CIBERESP. Consorcio de Investigación Biomédica en Red de Epidemiología y Salud Pública*

*University of the Basque Country (UVP-EHU).*

---

**De:** Holder, Gregory (CDC/DDNID/NCCDPHP/DOH) <[LHN5@cdc.gov](mailto:LHN5@cdc.gov)>  
**Enviado el:** viernes, 29 de julio de 2022 19:46  
**Para:** Gallastegi Bilbao, Mara <[m-gallastegibilbao@euskadi.eus](mailto:m-gallastegibilbao@euskadi.eus)>; Ibarluzea Maurologoitia, Jesús <[j-ibarluzea@euskadi.eus](mailto:j-ibarluzea@euskadi.eus)>  
**Asunto:** RE: Request to discuss your fluoride study

Algunos contactos que recibieron este mensaje no suelen recibir correos electrónicos de [lhn5@cdc.gov](mailto:lhn5@cdc.gov). Por qué esto es importante

Dear Drs. Gallastegi and Ibarluzea,

Good afternoon! My name is Gregory Holder, and I am the lead policy analyst here at the CDC Division of Oral Health. Our sincerest apologies for the long delay in communication. We've been hard at work on this issue in the meantime, and are still extremely interested in having you present the findings of your fluoride research to our center leadership.

If you are still willing to do so, please let me know and I can work on scheduling a mutually agreeable

time.

Again, we are very sorry for the delay, and look forward to hearing from you.

V/r

**Gregory Holder, MPH**

Public Health Analyst

Division of Oral Health

National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion

Centers for Disease Control and Prevention

(404) 498-5501 (office)

---

**De:** Hannan, Casey J. (CDC/DDNID/NCCDPHP/DOH) <[clh8@cdc.gov](mailto:clh8@cdc.gov)>

**Enviado:** martes, 19 de octubre de 2021 15:22

**Para:** Gallastegi Bilbao, Mara <[m-gallastegibilbao@euskadi.eus](mailto:m-gallastegibilbao@euskadi.eus)>

**Cc:** Johnson, Nicole (CDC/DDNID/NCCDPHP/DOH) <[nbg5@cdc.gov](mailto:nbg5@cdc.gov)>; Holder, Gregory (CDC/DDNID/NCCDPHP/DOH) <[LHN5@cdc.gov](mailto:LHN5@cdc.gov)>

**Asunto:** Request to discuss your fluoride study

Dear Dr. Gallastegi,

Greetings from the US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) in Atlanta, Georgia. The CDC strives to base policies, guidelines, and recommendations on the best available scientific evidence, which includes a commitment to transparency, honesty, and thorough consideration of available research.

Therefore, CDC would be pleased to host a virtual listening session to provide an opportunity for you to discuss the findings from your analyses [Prenatal exposure to fluoride and neuropsychological development in early childhood: 1-to 4 years old children](#) as appeared as preprint in Environmental Research. The purpose of the meeting will be solely informational, and will not constitute any guidance, evaluation, identification, or consideration by CDC of any proposed course of action.

We propose a 30-minute meeting, with 20 minutes for you to present your findings from the paper listed above, and 10 minutes for any clarifying questions we may have. I will attend, as will our center's Medical Director, the Director of CDC's Division of Oral Health. Would you please reply to all on this email with some dates and times you are available to connect by video call? We hope to be able to connect with you in the next few weeks.

Please be aware that CDC's invitation to meet should not in any way be construed to imply that CDC endorses or approves of any particular organization or its products or services, or that CDC agrees with any health claims that may be asserted. Also, note that any information provided during the meeting will be a matter of public record.

We appreciate your interest in this topic and look forward to the opportunity to listen to your perspective.

Kind regards,

Casey

**Casey J. Hannan, MPH**

*Director, Division of Oral Health  
Centers for Disease Control and Prevention*

[channan@cdc.gov](mailto:channan@cdc.gov)

770.488.6054 (office) | (b)(6) (mobile)

<http://www.cdc.gov/oralhealth/>

*Euskadi, auzolana, bien común*





**From:** Holder, Gregory (CDC/DDNID/NCCDPHP/DOH)  
**Sent:** Tue, 2 Aug 2022 14:03:50 +0000  
**To:** Ibarluzea Maurologoitia, Jesús  
**Cc:** Gallastegi Bilbao, Mara  
**Subject:** RE: Request to discuss your fluoride study

Dear Dr. Ibarluzea –

Best of luck on all of the congresses! We would certainly love to schedule a meeting towards the end of September/early October. I will check the availability of our senior leadership and respond with some dates. We will leave it to you to determine your presentation – we are most interested in the IQ study, but we also make it a point to stay abreast of all relevant research in the field and would be happy to hear of the newer studies as well.

I will try to get some dates to you before you leave for your vacation so we can rest easy knowing that this will be on the books.

V/r

**Gregory Holder, MPH**  
Public Health Analyst  
Division of Oral Health  
National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion  
Centers for Disease Control and Prevention  
(404) 498-5501 (office)

---

**From:** Ibarluzea Maurologoitia, Jesús <j-ibarluzea@euskadi.eus>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 2, 2022 2:44 AM  
**To:** Holder, Gregory (CDC/DDNID/NCCDPHP/DOH) <LHN5@cdc.gov>  
**Cc:** Gallastegi Bilbao, Mara <m-gallastegibilbao@euskadi.eus>  
**Subject:** RE: Request to discuss your fluoride study

Dear Gregory.

(b)(6) and at the end of it (Organizing Committee) the Spanish-Portuguese Epidemiology Congress is going to be held here in San Sebastian. We will be hard at work until the International Environmental Congress (ISEE-Athens) finish. So we could reschedule a presentation for the last days of September early November.

In both Congresses we will present the results of Fluoride (urine) and TDHD at 1, 7 and 11 years in the same cohort (INMA-Gipuzkoa). I do not know if you would be interested in including this data also in the presentation.

Looking forward to hearing from you.  
Jesús Ibarluzea

---

**De:** Holder, Gregory (CDC/DDNID/NCCDPHP/DOH) <LHN5@cdc.gov>

**Enviado el:** viernes, 29 de julio de 2022 19:46

**Para:** Gallastegi Bilbao, Mara <m-gallastegibilbao@euskadi.eus>; Ibarluzea Maurologoitia, Jesús <j-ibarluzea@euskadi.eus>

**Asunto:** RE: Request to discuss your fluoride study

Algunos contactos que recibieron este mensaje no suelen recibir correos electrónicos de [lh5@cdc.gov](mailto:lh5@cdc.gov). [Por qué esto es importante](#)

Dear Drs. Gallastegi and Ibarluzea,

Good afternoon! My name is Gregory Holder, and I am the lead policy analyst here at the CDC Division of Oral Health. Our sincerest apologies for the long delay in communication. We've been hard at work on this issue in the meantime, and are still extremely interested in having you present the findings of your fluoride research to our center leadership.

If you are still willing to do so, please let me know and I can work on scheduling a mutually agreeable time.

Again, we are very sorry for the delay, and look forward to hearing from you.

V/r

**Gregory Holder, MPH**

Public Health Analyst

Division of Oral Health

National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion

Centers for Disease Control and Prevention

(404) 498-5501 (office)

---

**From:** Gallastegi Bilbao, Mara <m-gallastegibilbao@euskadi.eus>

**Sent:** Sunday, November 14, 2021 5:14 PM

**To:** Hannan, Casey J. (CDC/DDNID/NCCDPHP/DOH) <clh8@cdc.gov>

**Cc:** Johnson, Nicole (CDC/DDNID/NCCDPHP/DOH) <nbg5@cdc.gov>; Holder, Gregory (CDC/DDNID/NCCDPHP/DOH) <LHN5@cdc.gov>; Ibarluzea Maurologoitia, Jesús <mambien3-san@euskadi.eus>

**Subject:** RE: Request to discuss your fluoride study

Dear Dr Hannan,

Many thanks for your interest in our research. The first author of the manuscript (Dr Ibarluzea, in CC) wrote you back accepting the invitation for an online meeting, but we are not sure whether you received it.

We would be available on the following dates and hours:

December 1st or 2nd. From 15.00 to 17.00 pm UTC+1 (**from 9 to 11 am in Atlanta, UTC-5**).

December 3rd. From: 15.00 to 16.00 pm UTC+1 (**from 9 to 10 am in Atlanta**)

Looking forward for your response,  
Best regards,

Mara Gallastegi

---

**De:** Hannan, Casey J. (CDC/DDNID/NCCDPHP/DOH) <[clh8@cdc.gov](mailto:clh8@cdc.gov)>  
**Enviado:** martes, 19 de octubre de 2021 15:22  
**Para:** Gallastegi Bilbao, Mara <[m-gallastegibilbao@euskadi.eus](mailto:m-gallastegibilbao@euskadi.eus)>  
**Cc:** Johnson, Nicole (CDC/DDNID/NCCDPHP/DOH) <[nbg5@cdc.gov](mailto:nbg5@cdc.gov)>; Holder, Gregory (CDC/DDNID/NCCDPHP/DOH) <[LHN5@cdc.gov](mailto:LHN5@cdc.gov)>  
**Asunto:** Request to discuss your fluoride study

Dear Dr. Gallastegi,

Greetings from the US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) in Atlanta, Georgia. The CDC strives to base policies, guidelines, and recommendations on the best available scientific evidence, which includes a commitment to transparency, honesty, and thorough consideration of available research.

Therefore, CDC would be pleased to host a virtual listening session to provide an opportunity for you to discuss the findings from your analyses [Prenatal exposure to fluoride and neuropsychological development in early childhood: 1-to 4 years old children](#) as appeared as preprint in Environmental Research. The purpose of the meeting will be solely informational, and will not constitute any guidance, evaluation, identification, or consideration by CDC of any proposed course of action.

We propose a 30-minute meeting, with 20 minutes for you to present your findings from the paper listed above, and 10 minutes for any clarifying questions we may have. I will attend, as will our center's Medical Director, the Director of CDC's Division of Oral Health. Would you please reply to all on this email with some dates and times you are available to connect by video call? We hope to be able to connect with you in the next few weeks.

Please be aware that CDC's invitation to meet should not in any way be construed to imply that CDC endorses or approves of any particular organization or its products or services, or that CDC agrees with any health claims that may be asserted. Also, note that any information provided during the meeting will be a matter of public record.

We appreciate your interest in this topic and look forward to the opportunity to listen to your perspective.

Kind regards,

Casey

**Casey J. Hannan, MPH**

**Director**, Division of Oral Health  
Centers for Disease Control and Prevention

[channan@cdc.gov](mailto:channan@cdc.gov)

770.488.6054 (office) | (b)(6) (mobile)

<http://www.cdc.gov/oralhealth/>